

Network Working Group
Request for Comments: 3678
Category: Informational

D. Thaler
Microsoft
B. Fenner
AT&T Research
B. Quinn
Stardust.com
January 2004

Socket Interface Extensions for Multicast Source Filters

Status of this Memo

This memo provides information for the Internet community. It does not specify an Internet standard of any kind. Distribution of this memo is unlimited.

Copyright Notice

Copyright (C) The Internet Society (2004). All Rights Reserved.

Abstract

The Internet Group Management Protocol (IGMPv3) for IPv4 and the Multicast Listener Discovery (MLDv2) for IPv6 add the capability for applications to express source filters on multicast group memberships, which allows receiver applications to determine the set of senders (sources) from which to accept multicast traffic. This capability also simplifies support of one-to-many type multicast applications.

This document specifies new socket options and functions to manage source filters for IP Multicast group memberships. It also defines the socket structures to provide input and output arguments to these new application program interfaces (APIs). These extensions are designed to provide access to the source filtering features, while introducing a minimum of change into the system and providing complete compatibility for existing multicast applications.

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	2
2. Design Considerations.	3
2.1 What Needs to be Added	4
2.2 Data Types	4
2.3 Headers.	4
2.4 Structures	4
3. Overview of APIs.	5

4. IPv4 Multicast Source Filter APIs	6
4.1 Basic (Delta-based) API for IPv4.	6
4.1.1 IPv4 Any-Source Multicast API.	7
4.1.2 IPv4 Source-Specific Multicast API	7
4.1.3 Error Codes.	8
4.2 Advanced (Full-state) API for IPv4.	8
4.2.1 Set Source Filter.	8
4.2.2 Get Source Filter.	9
5: Protocol-Independent Multicast Source Filter APIs	10
5.1 Basic (Delta-based) API	10
5.1.1 Any-Source Multicast API	11
5.1.2 Source-Specific Multicast API.	11
5.2 Advanced (Full-state) API	11
5.2.1 Set Source Filter.	11
5.2.2 Get Source Filter.	12
6. Security Considerations.	13
7. Acknowledgments.	13
8. Appendix A: Use of ioctl() for full-state operations	14
8.1. IPv4 Options.	14
8.2. Protocol-Independent Options.	15
9. Normative References	16
10. Informative References	16
11. Authors' Addresses	17
12. Full Copyright Statement	18

1. Introduction

The de facto standard application program interface (API) for TCP/IP applications is the "sockets" interface. Although this API was developed for Unix in the early 1980s it has also been implemented on a wide variety of non-Unix systems. TCP/IP applications written using the sockets API have in the past enjoyed a high degree of portability and we would like the same portability with applications that employ multicast source filters. Changes are required to the sockets API to support such filtering and this memo describes these changes.

This document specifies new socket options and functions to manage source filters for IP Multicast group memberships. It also defines the socket structures to provide input and output arguments to these new APIs. These extensions are designed to provide access to the source filtering features required by applications, while introducing a minimum of change into the system and providing complete compatibility for existing multicast applications.

Furthermore, RFC 3493 [1] defines socket interface extensions for IPv6, including protocol-independent functions for most operations.

However, while it defines join and leave functions for IPv6, it does not provide protocol-independent versions of these operations. Such functions will be described in this document.

The reader should note that this document is for informational purposes only, and that the official standard specification of the sockets API is [2].

2. Design Considerations

There are a number of important considerations in designing changes to this well-worn API:

- o The API changes should provide both source and binary compatibility for programs written to the original API. That is, existing program binaries should continue to operate when run on a system supporting the new API. In addition, existing applications that are re-compiled and run on a system supporting the new API should continue to operate. Simply put, the API changes for multicast receivers that specify source filters should not break existing programs.
- o The changes to the API should be as small as possible in order to simplify the task of converting existing multicast receiver applications to use source filters.
- o Applications should be able to detect when the new source filter APIs are unavailable (e.g., calls fail with the ENOTSUPP error) and react gracefully (e.g., revert to old non-source-filter API or display a meaningful error message to the user).
- o Lack of type-safety in an API is a bad thing which should be avoided when possible.

Several implementations exist that use `ioctl()` for a portion of the functionality described herein, and for historical purposes, the `ioctl` API is documented in Appendix A. The preferred API, however, includes new functions. The reasons for adding new functions are:

- o New functions provide type-safety, unlike `ioctl`, `getsockopt`, and `setsockopt`.
- o A new function can be written as a wrapper over an `ioctl`, `getsockopt`, or `setsockopt` call, if necessary. Hence, it provides more freedom as to how the functionality is implemented in an operating system. For example, a new function might be implemented as an inline function in an

include file, or a function exported from a user-mode library which internally uses some mechanism to exchange information with the kernel, or be implemented directly in the kernel.

- o At least one operation defined herein needs to be able to both pass information to the TCP/IP stack, as well as retrieve information from it. In some implementations this is problematic without either changing `getsockopt` or using `ioctl`. Using new functions avoids the need to change such implementations.

2.1. What Needs to be Added

The current IP Multicast APIs allow a receiver application to specify the group address (destination) and (optionally) the local interface. These existing APIs need not change (and cannot, to retain binary compatibility). Hence, what is needed are new source filter APIs that provide the same functionality and also allow receiver multicast applications to:

- o Specify zero or more unicast (source) address(es) in a source filter.
- o Determine whether the source filter describes an inclusive or exclusive list of sources.

The new API design must enable this functionality for both IPv4 and IPv6.

2.2. Data Types

The data types of the structure elements given in this memo are intended to be examples, not absolute requirements. Whenever possible, data types from POSIX 1003.1g [2] are used: `uintN_t` means an unsigned integer of exactly N bits (e.g., `uint32_t`).

2.3. Headers

When function prototypes and structures are shown, we show the headers that must be `#included` to cause that item to be defined.

2.4. Structures

When structures are described, the members shown are the ones that must appear in an implementation. Additional, nonstandard members may also be defined by an implementation. As an additional

precaution, nonstandard members could be verified by Feature Test Macros as described in [2]. (Such Feature Test Macros are not defined by this RFC.)

The ordering shown for the members of a structure is the recommended ordering, given alignment considerations of multibyte members, but an implementation may order the members differently.

3. Overview of APIs

There are a number of different APIs described in this document that are appropriate for a number of different application types and IP versions. Before providing detailed descriptions, this section provides a "taxonomy" with a brief description of each.

There are two categories of source-filter APIs, both of which are designed to allow multicast receiver applications to designate the unicast address(es) of sender(s) along with the multicast group (destination address) to receive.

- o Basic (Delta-based): Some applications desire the simplicity of a delta-based API in which each function call specifies a single source address which should be added to or removed from the existing filter for a given multicast group address on which to listen. Such applications typically fall into either of two categories:
 - + Any-Source Multicast: By default, all sources are accepted. Individual sources may be turned off and back on as needed over time. This is also known as "exclude" mode, since the source filter contains a list of excluded sources.
 - + Source-Specific Multicast: Only sources in a given list are allowed. The list may change over time. This is also known as "include" mode, since the source filter contains a list of included sources.

This API would be used, for example, by "single-source" applications such as audio/video broadcasting. It would also be used for logical multi-source sessions where each source independently allocates its own Source-Specific Multicast group address.

- o Advanced (Full-state): This API allows an application to define a complete source-filter comprised of zero or more source addresses, and replace the previous filter with a new one.

Applications which require the ability to switch between filter modes without leaving a group must use a full-state API (i.e., to change the semantics of the source filter from inclusive to exclusive, or vice versa).

Applications which use a large source list for a given group address should also use the full-state API, since filter changes can be done atomically in a single operation.

The above types of APIs exist in IPv4-specific variants as well as with protocol-independent variants. One might ask why the protocol-independent APIs cannot accommodate IPv4 applications as well as IPv6. Since any IPv4 application requires modification to use multicast source filters anyway, it might seem like a good opportunity to create IPv6-compatible source code.

The primary reasons for extending an IPv4-specific API are:

- o To minimize changes needed in existing IPv4 multicast application source code to add source filter support.
- o To avoid overloading APIs to accommodate the differences between IPv4 interface addresses (e.g., in the `ip_mreq` structure) and interface indices.

4. IPv4 Multicast Source Filter APIs

Version 3 of the Internet Group Management Protocol (IGMPv3) [3] and version 2 of the Multicast Listener Discovery (MLDv2) protocol [4] provide the ability to communicate source filter information to the router and hence avoid pulling down data from unwanted sources onto the local link. However, source filters may be implemented by the operating system regardless of whether the routers support IGMPv3 or MLDv2, so when the source-filter API is available, applications can always benefit from using it.

4.1. Basic (Delta-based) API for IPv4

The reception of multicast packets is controlled by the `setsockopt()` options summarized below. An error of `EOPNOTSUPP` is returned if these options are used with `getsockopt()`.

The following structures are used by both the Any-Source Multicast and the Source-Specific Multicast API:

```
#include <netinet/in.h>

struct ip_mreq {
    struct in_addr imr_multiaddr; /* IP address of group */
    struct in_addr imr_interface; /* IP address of interface */
};

struct ip_mreq_source {
    struct in_addr imr_multiaddr; /* IP address of group */
    struct in_addr imr_sourceaddr; /* IP address of source */
    struct in_addr imr_interface; /* IP address of interface */
};
```

4.1.1. IPv4 Any-Source Multicast API

The following socket options are defined in <netinet/in.h> for applications in the Any-Source Multicast category:

Socket option	Argument type
IP_ADD_MEMBERSHIP	struct ip_mreq
IP_BLOCK_SOURCE	struct ip_mreq_source
IP_UNBLOCK_SOURCE	struct ip_mreq_source
IP_DROP_MEMBERSHIP	struct ip_mreq

IP_ADD_MEMBERSHIP and IP_DROP_MEMBERSHIP are already implemented on most operating systems, and are used to join and leave an any-source group.

IP_BLOCK_SOURCE can be used to block data from a given source to a given group (e.g., if the user "mutes" that source), and IP_UNBLOCK_SOURCE can be used to undo this (e.g., if the user then "unmutes" the source).

4.1.2. IPv4 Source-Specific Multicast API

The following socket options are available for applications in the Source-Specific category:

Socket option	Argument type
IP_ADD_SOURCE_MEMBERSHIP	struct ip_mreq_source
IP_DROP_SOURCE_MEMBERSHIP	struct ip_mreq_source
IP_DROP_MEMBERSHIP	struct ip_mreq

IP_ADD_SOURCE_MEMBERSHIP and IP_DROP_SOURCE_MEMBERSHIP are used to join and leave a source-specific group.

IP_DROP_MEMBERSHIP is supported, as a convenience, to drop all sources which have been joined for a particular group and interface. The operations are the same as if the socket had been closed.

4.1.3. Error Codes

When the option would be legal on the group, but an address is invalid (e.g., when trying to block a source that is already blocked by the socket, or when trying to drop an unjoined group) the error generated is EADDRNOTAVAIL.

When the option itself is not legal on the group (i.e., when trying a Source-Specific option on a group after doing IP_ADD_MEMBERSHIP, or when trying an Any-Source option without doing IP_ADD_MEMBERSHIP) the error generated is EINVAL.

When any of these options are used with getsockopt(), the error generated is EOPNOTSUPP.

Finally, if the implementation imposes a limit on the maximum number of sources in a source filter, ENOBUFS is generated when an operation would exceed the maximum.

4.2. Advanced (Full-state) API for IPv4

Several implementations exist that use ioctl() for this API, and for historical purposes, the ioctl() API is documented in Appendix A. The preferred API uses the new functions described below.

4.2.1. Set Source Filter

```
#include <netinet/in.h>
```

```
int setipv4sourcefilter(int s, struct in_addr interface,  
                        struct in_addr group, uint32_t fmode,  
                        uint32_t numsrc, struct in_addr *slist);
```

On success the value 0 is returned, and on failure, the value -1 is returned and errno is set accordingly.

The s argument identifies the socket.

The interface argument holds the local IP address of the interface.

The group argument holds the IP multicast address of the group.

The `fmode` argument identifies the filter mode. The value of this field must be either `MCAST_INCLUDE` or `MCAST_EXCLUDE`, which are likewise defined in `<netinet/in.h>`.

The `numsrc` argument holds the number of source addresses in the `slist` array.

The `slist` argument points to an array of IP addresses of sources to include or exclude depending on the filter mode.

If the implementation imposes a limit on the maximum number of sources in a source filter, `ENOBUFS` is generated when the operation would exceed the maximum.

4.2.2. Get Source Filter

```
#include <netinet/in.h>
```

```
int getipv4sourcefilter(int s, struct in_addr interface,  
                        struct in_addr group, uint32_t *fmode,  
                        uint32_t *numsrc, struct in_addr *slist);
```

On success the value 0 is returned, and on failure, the value -1 is returned and `errno` is set accordingly.

The `s` argument identifies the socket.

The `interface` argument holds the local IP address of the interface.

The `group` argument holds the IP multicast address of the group.

The `fmode` argument points to an integer that will contain the filter mode on a successful return. The value of this field will be either `MCAST_INCLUDE` or `MCAST_EXCLUDE`, which are likewise defined in `<netinet/in.h>`.

On input, the `numsrc` argument holds the number of source addresses that will fit in the `slist` array. On output, the `numsrc` argument will hold the total number of sources in the filter.

The `slist` argument points to buffer into which an array of IP addresses of included or excluded (depending on the filter mode) sources will be written. If `numsrc` was 0 on input, a NULL pointer may be supplied.

If the application does not know the size of the source list beforehand, it can make a reasonable guess (e.g., 0), and if upon completion, numsrc holds a larger value, the operation can be repeated with a large enough buffer.

That is, on return, numsrc is always updated to be the total number of sources in the filter, while slist will hold as many source addresses as fit, up to the minimum of the array size passed in as the original numsrc value and the total number of sources in the filter.

5. Protocol-Independent Multicast Source Filter APIs

Protocol-independent functions are provided for join and leave operations so that an application may pass a sockaddr_storage structure obtained from calls such as getaddrinfo() [1] as the group to join. For example, an application can resolve a DNS name (e.g., NTP.MCAST.NET) to a multicast address which may be either IPv4 or IPv6, and may easily join and leave the group.

5.1. Basic (Delta-based) API

The reception of multicast packets is controlled by the setsockopt() options summarized below. An error of EOPNOTSUPP is returned if these options are used with getsockopt().

The following structures are used by both the Any-Source Multicast and the Source-Specific Multicast API: #include <netinet/in.h>

```
struct group_req {
    uint32_t          gr_interface; /* interface index */
    struct sockaddr_storage gr_group; /* group address */
};

struct group_source_req {
    uint32_t          gsr_interface; /* interface index */
    struct sockaddr_storage gsr_group; /* group address */
    struct sockaddr_storage gsr_source; /* source address */
};
```

The sockaddr_storage structure is defined in RFC 3493 [1] to be large enough to hold either IPv4 or IPv6 address information.

The rules for generating errors are the same as those given in Section 5.1.3.

5.1.1. Any-Source Multicast API

Socket option	Argument type
MCAST_JOIN_GROUP	struct group_req
MCAST_BLOCK_SOURCE	struct group_source_req
MCAST_UNBLOCK_SOURCE	struct group_source_req
MCAST_LEAVE_GROUP	struct group_req

MCAST_JOIN_GROUP and MCAST_LEAVE_GROUP are used to join and leave an any-source group.

MCAST_BLOCK_SOURCE can be used to block data from a given source to a given group (e.g., if the user "mutes" that source), and MCAST_UNBLOCK_SOURCE can be used to undo this (e.g., if the user then "unmutes" the source).

5.1.2. Source-Specific Multicast API

Socket option	Argument type
MCAST_JOIN_SOURCE_GROUP	struct group_source_req
MCAST_LEAVE_SOURCE_GROUP	struct group_source_req
MCAST_LEAVE_GROUP	struct group_req

MCAST_JOIN_SOURCE_GROUP and MCAST_LEAVE_SOURCE_GROUP are used to join and leave a source-specific group.

MCAST_LEAVE_GROUP is supported, as a convenience, to drop all sources which have been joined for a particular group and interface. The operations are the same as if the socket had been closed.

5.2. Advanced (Full-state) API

Implementations may exist that use `ioctl()` for this API, and for historical purposes, the `ioctl()` API is documented in Appendix A. The preferred API uses the new functions described below.

5.2.1. Set Source Filter

```
#include <netinet/in.h>

int setsourcefilter(int s, uint32_t interface,
                   struct sockaddr *group, socklen_t grouplen,
                   uint32_t fmode, uint_t numsrc,
                   struct sockaddr_storage *slist);
```

On success the value 0 is returned, and on failure, the value -1 is returned and `errno` is set accordingly.

The `s` argument identifies the socket.

The `interface` argument holds the interface index of the interface.

The `group` argument points to either a `sockaddr_in` structure (for IPv4) or a `sockaddr_in6` structure (for IPv6) that holds the IP multicast address of the group.

The `grouplen` argument gives the length of the `sockaddr_in` or `sockaddr_in6` structure.

The `fmode` argument identifies the filter mode. The value of this field must be either `MCAST_INCLUDE` or `MCAST_EXCLUDE`, which are likewise defined in `<netinet/in.h>`.

The `numsrc` argument holds the number of source addresses in the `slist` array.

The `slist` argument points to an array of IP addresses of sources to include or exclude depending on the filter mode.

If the implementation imposes a limit on the maximum number of sources in a source filter, `ENOBUFS` is generated when the operation would exceed the maximum.

5.2.2. Get Source Filter

```
#include <netinet/in.h>
```

```
int getsourcefilter(int s, uint32_t interface,  
                    struct sockaddr *group, socklen_t grouplen,  
                    uint32_t fmode, uint_t *numsrc,  
                    struct sockaddr_storage *slist);
```

On success the value 0 is returned, and on failure, the value -1 is returned and `errno` is set accordingly.

The `s` argument identifies the socket.

The `interface` argument holds the local IP address of the interface.

The `group` argument points to either a `sockaddr_in` structure (for IPv4) or a `sockaddr_in6` structure (for IPv6) that holds the IP multicast address of the group.

The `fmode` argument points to an integer that will contain the filter mode on a successful return. The value of this field will be either `MCAST_INCLUDE` or `MCAST_EXCLUDE`, which are likewise defined in `<netinet/in.h>`.

On input, the `numsrc` argument holds the number of source addresses that will fit in the `slist` array. On output, the `numsrc` argument will hold the total number of sources in the filter.

The `slist` argument points to buffer into which an array of IP addresses of included or excluded (depending on the filter mode) sources will be written. If `numsrc` was 0 on input, a NULL pointer may be supplied.

If the application does not know the size of the source list beforehand, it can make a reasonable guess (e.g., 0), and if upon completion, `numsrc` holds a larger value, the operation can be repeated with a large enough buffer.

That is, on return, `numsrc` is always updated to be the total number of sources in the filter, while `slist` will hold as many source addresses as fit, up to the minimum of the array size passed in as the original `numsrc` value and the total number of sources in the filter.

6. Security Considerations

Although source filtering can help to combat denial-of-service attacks, source filtering alone is not a complete solution, since it does not provide protection against spoofing the source address to be an allowed source. Multicast routing protocols which use reverse-path forwarding based on the source address, however, do provide some natural protection against spoofing the source address, since if a router receives a packet on an interface other than the one toward the "real" source, it will drop the packet. However, this still does not provide any guarantee of protection.

7. Acknowledgments

This document was updated based on feedback from the IETF's IDMR and MAGMA Working Groups, and the Austin Group. Wilbert de Graaf also provided many helpful comments.

8. Appendix A: Use of ioctl() for full-state operations

The API defined here is historic, but is documented here for informational purposes since it is implemented by multiple platforms. The new functions defined earlier in this document should now be used instead.

Retrieving the source filter for a given group cannot be done with getsockopt() on some existing platforms, since the group and interface must be passed down in order to retrieve the correct filter, and getsockopt only supports an output buffer. This can, however, be done with an ioctl(), and hence for symmetry, both gets and sets are done with an ioctl.

8.1. IPv4 Options

The following are defined in <sys/sockio.h>:

- o ioctl() SIOCGIPMSFILTER: to retrieve the list of source addresses that comprise the source filter along with the current filter mode.
- o ioctl() SIOCSIPMSFILTER: to set or modify the source filter content (e.g., unicast source address list) or mode (exclude or include).

Ioctl option	Argument type
SIOCGIPMSFILTER	struct ip_msfilter
SIOCSIPMSFILTER	struct ip_msfilter

```
struct ip_msfilter {
    struct in_addr imsf_multiaddr; /* IP multicast address of group */
    struct in_addr imsf_interface; /* local IP address of interface */
    uint32_t       imsf_fmode;     /* filter mode */
    uint32_t       imsf_numsrc;     /* number of sources in src_list */
    struct in_addr imsf_slist[1];  /* start of source list */
};
```

```
#define IP_MSFILTER_SIZE(numsrc) \
    (sizeof(struct ip_msfilter) - sizeof(struct in_addr) \
     + (numsrc) * sizeof(struct in_addr))
```

The imsf_fmode mode is a 32-bit integer that identifies the filter mode. The value of this field must be either MCAST_INCLUDE or MCAST_EXCLUDE, which are likewise defined in <netinet/in.h>.

The structure length pointed to must be at least `IP_MSFILTER_SIZE(0)` bytes long, and the `imsf_numsrc` parameter should be set so that `IP_MSFILTER_SIZE(imsf_numsrc)` indicates the buffer length.

If the implementation imposes a limit on the maximum number of sources in a source filter, `ENOBUFS` is generated when a set operation would exceed the maximum.

The result of a get operation (`SIOCGIPMSFILTER`) will be that the `imsf_multiaddr` and `imsf_interface` fields will be unchanged, while `imsf_fmode`, `imsf_numsrc`, and as many source addresses as fit will be filled into the application's buffer.

If the application does not know the size of the source list beforehand, it can make a reasonable guess (e.g., 0), and if upon completion, the `imsf_numsrc` field holds a larger value, the operation can be repeated with a large enough buffer.

That is, on return from `SIOCGIPMSFILTER`, `imsf_numsrc` is always updated to be the total number of sources in the filter, while `imsf_slist` will hold as many source addresses as fit, up to the minimum of the array size passed in as the original `imsf_numsrc` value and the total number of sources in the filter.

8.2. Protocol-Independent Options

The following are defined in `<sys/socket.h>`:

- o `ioctl()` `SIOCGMSFILTER`: to retrieve the list of source addresses that comprise the source filter along with the current filter mode.
- o `ioctl()` `SIOCSMSFILTER`: to set or modify the source filter content (e.g., unicast source address list) or mode (exclude or include).

<code>Ioctl option</code>	<code>Argument type</code>
<code>SIOCGMSFILTER</code>	<code>struct group_filter</code>
<code>SIOCSMSFILTER</code>	<code>struct group_filter</code>

```
struct group_filter {
    uint32_t          gf_interface; /* interface index */
    struct sockaddr_storage gf_group; /* multicast address */
    uint32_t          gf_fmode;     /* filter mode */
    uint32_t          gf_numsrc;    /* number of sources */
    struct sockaddr_storage gf_slist[1]; /* source address */
};
```

```
#define GROUP_FILTER_SIZE(numsrc) \  
    (sizeof(struct group_filter) - sizeof(struct sockaddr_storage) \  
    + (numsrc) * sizeof(struct sockaddr_storage))
```

The `imf_nums` field is used in the same way as described for `imsf_nums` above.

9. Normative References

- [1] Gilligan, R., Thomson, S., Bound, J., McCann, J. and W. Stevens, "Basic Socket Interface Extensions for IPv6", RFC 3493, February 2003.
- [2] IEEE Std. 1003.1-2001 Standard for Information Technology -- Portable Operating System Interface (POSIX). Open Group Technical Standard: Base Specifications, Issue 6, December 2001. ISO/IEC 9945:2002. <http://www.opengroup.org/austin>

10. Informative References

- [3] Cain, B., Deering, S., Kouvelas, I., Fenner, B. and A. Thyagarajan, "Internet Group Management Protocol, Version 3", RFC 3376, October 2002.
- [4] Vida, R. and L. Costa, "Multicast Listener Discovery Version 2 (MLDv2) for IPv6", Work in Progress, December 2003.

11. Authors' Addresses

Dave Thaler
Microsoft Corporation
One Microsoft Way
Redmond, WA 98052-6399

Phone: +1 425 703 8835
EMail: dthaler@microsoft.com

Bill Fenner
75 Willow Road
Menlo Park, CA 94025

Phone: +1 650 867 6073
EMail: fenner@research.att.com

Bob Quinn
IP Multicast Initiative (IPMI)
Stardust.com
1901 S. Bascom Ave. #333
Campbell, CA 95008

Phone: +1 408 879 8080
EMail: rcq@ipmulticast.com

12. Full Copyright Statement

Copyright (C) The Internet Society (2004). All Rights Reserved.

This document and translations of it may be copied and furnished to others, and derivative works that comment on or otherwise explain it or assist in its implementation may be prepared, copied, published and distributed, in whole or in part, without restriction of any kind, provided that the above copyright notice and this paragraph are included on all such copies and derivative works. However, this document itself may not be modified in any way, such as by removing the copyright notice or references to the Internet Society or other Internet organizations, except as needed for the purpose of developing Internet standards in which case the procedures for copyrights defined in the Internet Standards process must be followed, or as required to translate it into languages other than English.

The limited permissions granted above are perpetual and will not be revoked by the Internet Society or its successors or assignees.

This document and the information contained herein is provided on an "AS IS" basis and THE INTERNET SOCIETY AND THE INTERNET ENGINEERING TASK FORCE DISCLAIMS ALL WARRANTIES, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO ANY WARRANTY THAT THE USE OF THE INFORMATION HEREIN WILL NOT INFRINGE ANY RIGHTS OR ANY IMPLIED WARRANTIES OF MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR A PARTICULAR PURPOSE.

Acknowledgement

Funding for the RFC Editor function is currently provided by the Internet Society.

